

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

)
)
)
IN RE: BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD) **Master File No. 2:13-CV-20000-RDP**
ANTITRUST LITIGATION)
(MDL No. 2406)) This document relates to all cases.
)
)
)
)

**DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS PROVIDERS'
CONSOLIDATED FOURTH AMENDED COMPLAINT**

For the reasons set forth in the accompanying brief, Defendants hereby move this Court pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6) to dismiss Counts IV through X (and Count I to the extent that it relies on any Rule of Reason or Section 2 claim)¹ of the Consolidated Fourth Amended Provider Complaint (ECF No. 1083) for failure to state a claim upon which relief can be granted.

Dated: May 17, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Andrew P. Campbell

Andrew P. Campbell (CAM006)
Campbell, Guin, Williams, Guy & Gidere, LLC
505 North 20th Street, Suite 1600
Birmingham, AL 35203
Telephone: (205) 224-0750
Fax: (205) 224-8622
Email: andrew.campbell@campbellguin.com

Counsel for Defendant Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan

¹ This motion relates to all of the rule of reason and Section 2 claims in the Consolidated Fourth Amended Provider Complaint.

Kimberly R. West
Wallace, Jordan, Ratliff & Brandt LLC
800 Shades Creek Pkwy. Suite 400
Birmingham, Alabama 35209
T: (205) 874-0345
C: (205) 915-9521
F: (205) 871-2534
kwest@wallacejordan.com

David J. Zott, P.C.
Daniel E. Laytin, P.C.
Sarah J. Donnell
Christa C. Cottrell
Zachary Holmstead
Jessica L. Staiger
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
300 North LaSalle
Chicago, IL 60654
Tel: (312) 862-2000
Fax: (312) 862-2200
david.zott@kirkland.com
daniel.laytin@kirkland.com
sdonnell@kirkland.com
ccottrell@kirkland.com
zachary.holmstead@kirkland.com
jessica.staiger@kirkland.com

Counsel for Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association

Charles L. Sweeris
Law Department
BLUE SHIELD OF CALIFORNIA
50 Beale St.
San Francisco, CA 94105
415-229-5107
(fax) 415-229-5343
charles.sweeris@blueshieldca.com
marcy.stjohn@blueshieldca.com

Counsel for California Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of California

Carl S. Burkhalter
James L. Priester
John Thomas Malatesta, III
MAYNARD COOPER & GALE PC
1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 2400
Birmingham, AL 35203
Phone: 205-254-1000
Fax: 205-254-1999
cburkhalter@marnardcooper.com
jpriester@marnardcooper.com
jmalatesta@marnardcooper.com

Pamela B. Slate
HILL HILL CARTER FRANCO COLE &
BLACK, P.C.
425 South Perry Street
Montgomery, AL 36104
334-834-7600
(fax) 334-386-4381
pslate@hillhillcarter.com

Counsel for Blue Cross Blue Shield of Alabama

Todd M. Stenerson
D. Bruce Hoffman
Hunton & Williams LLP
2200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20037
Phone: 202-955-1500
Fax: 202-778-7436
tstenerson@hunton.com
bhoffman@hunton.com

Jason R. Gourley
Sarah L. Cykowski
Bodman PLC
201 South Division Street, Suite 400
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
Phone: 734-761-3780
Fax: 734-930-2494
jgourley@bodmanlaw.com
scykowski@bodmanlaw.com

Additional Counsel for Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan

H. James Koch
ARMBRECHT JACKSON LLP
63 South Royal Street, 13th Floor
Riverview Plaza
Mobile, AL 36602
251-405-1300
(fax) 251-432-6843
hjk@ajlaw.com

Brian K. Norman
SHAMOUN & NORMAN LLP
Four Hickory Center
1755 Wittington Place, Suite 200, LB 25
Dallas, TX 75234
214-987-1745
(fax) 214-521-9033
bkn@snlegal.com

Counsel for CareFirst of Maryland, Inc. and CareFirst BlueCross BlueShield d/b/a/ Group Hospitalization and Medical Services, Inc.

Michael A. Naranjo
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP
555 California Street, Suite 1700
San Francisco, CA 94104-1520
415-984-9847
(fax) 415-434-4507
mnaranjo@foley.com

Alan D. Rutenberg
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP
3000 K Street, NW, Suite 600
Washington, D.C. 20007-5109
202-672-5491
(fax) 202-672-5399
arutenberg@foley.com

Counsel for USAble Mutual Insurance Company, d/b/a Arkansas Blue Cross and Blue Shield

Gwendolyn C. Payton
Erin M. Wilson
LANE POWELL PC
1420 Fifth Avenue, Suite 4200
Seattle, WA 98101-2338
206-223-7000
(fax) 206-223-7107
paytong@lanepowell.com
wilsonem@lanepowell.com

J. Bentley Owens, III
Wallace Ellis Fowler Head & Justice
P. O. Box 587
Columbiana, AL 35051
205-669-6783
(fax) 205-669-4932
bowens@wefhlaw.com

Counsel for Premera Blue Cross Blue Shield of Alaska and Premera Blue Cross of Washington

Edward S. Bloomberg
PHILLIPS LYTHE LLP
125 Main Street
Buffalo, NY 14203-2887
716-847-7096
(fax) 716-852-6100
ebloomberg@phillipslytle.com

Counsel for Excellus BlueCross BlueShield of New York

Robert K. Spotswood
Michael T. Sansbury
Joshua K. Payne
SPOTSWOOD SANSOM & SANSBURY LLC
One Federal Place
1819 Fifth Avenue North, Suite 1050
Birmingham, Alabama 35203
205-986-3620
(fax) 205-986-3639
rks@spotswoodllc.com
msansbury@spotswoodllc.com
jpayne@spotswoodllc.com

Counsel for Capital Blue Cross

Craig A. Hoover
J. Robert Robertson
E. Desmond Hogan
Justin W. Bernick
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
Columbia Square
555 Thirteenth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20004
202-637-5600
(fax) 202-637-5910
craig.hoover@hoganlovells.com
robbi.robertson@hoganlovells.com
desmond.hogan@hoganlovells.com
justin.bernick@hoganlovells.com

Emily M. Yinger
N. Thomas Connally, III
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
Park Place II
7930 Jones Branch Drive, Ninth Floor
McLean, VA 22102
703-610-6100
(fax) 703-610-6200
emily.yinger@hoganlovells.com
tom.connally@hoganlovells.com

Cavender C. Kimble
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP
1901 6th Avenue N, Suite 1500
Birmingham, AL 35203-4642
205-226-3437
(fax) 205-488-5860
ckimble@balch.com

Defendants' Co-Coordinating Counsel and Counsel for Anthem, Inc.; Anthem Health Plans, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Connecticut); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Georgia, Inc.; Anthem Insurance Companies, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Indiana); Anthem Health Plans of Maine, Inc.; HMO Missouri, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Missouri); Anthem Health Plans of New Hampshire, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Hampshire); Anthem Health Plans of Virginia, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Virginia Inc.); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of North

Kathleen Taylor Sooy
Tracy A. Roman
April N. Ross
Michael W. Lieberman
CROWELL & MORING LLP
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004
202-624-2500
(fax) 202-628-5116
ksooy@crowell.com
troman@crowell.com
arross@crowell.com
mlieberman@crowell.com

John M. Johnson
Brian P. Kappel
LIGHTFOOT FRANKLIN & WHITE LLC
400 20th Street North
Birmingham, AL 35203
205-581-0700
(fax) 205-581-0799
jjohnson@lightfootlaw.com
bkappel@lightfootlaw.com

Counsel for Blue Cross Blue Shield of Arizona, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas City, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Nebraska, Blue Cross of Idaho Health Service, Inc., Blue Cross Blue Shield of North Dakota, Blue Cross Blue Shield of Wyoming and HealthNow New York Inc.

Rafael Escalera-Rodriguez
Sylmarie Arizmendi
Gustavo Pabon-Rico
REICHARD & ESCALERA
PO Box 364148
San Juan, PR 00936-4148
Phone: 787-777-8888
Fax: 787-765-4225
escalera@reichardescalera.com
arizmendis@reichardescalera.com
pabong@reichardescalera.com

Counsel for Triple S - Salud, Inc.

Carolina, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Massachusetts; BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Carolina; Hawaii Medical Service Association (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii); Horizon Healthcare Services, Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); WellPoint, Inc.; Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode Island; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Vermont; Anthem Holdings Corp. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield); Anthem Blue Cross Life and Health Insurance Company; Anthem Health Plans of Kentucky, Inc.; Anthem Holdings Corp.; Anthem Life Insurance Company; RightChoice Managed Care, Inc.; Healthy Alliance Life Insurance Company; Blue Cross of California; Blue Cross of California Partnership Plan, Inc.; Blue Cross of Southern California; Blue Cross of Northern California; Rocky Mountain Hospital & Medical Service Inc. d/b/a Anthem Blue Cross Blue Shield of Colorado; Rocky Mountain Hospital & Medical Service Inc. d/b/a Anthem Blue Cross Blue Shield of Nevada; Empire BlueCross BlueShield (Empire HealthChoice Assurance, Inc.); Blue Cross Blue Shield of Wisconsin (Anthem Blue Cross Blue Shield of Wisconsin); Community Insurance Company as Anthem Blue Cross Blue Shield of Ohio; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (in Washington); Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon

John Martin
Lucile H. Cohen
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
SCARBOROUGH LLP
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor
Columbia, SC 29201
803-799-2000
(fax) 803-256-7500
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com

Counsel for Anthem, Inc.; Anthem Health Plans, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Connecticut);

Kimberly R. West
Wallace, Jordan, Ratliff & Brandt LLC
800 Shades Creek Pkwy. Suite 400
Birmingham, Alabama 35209
T: (205) 874-0345
C: (205) 915-9521
F: (205) 871-2534
kwest@wallacejordan.com

Defendants' Liaison Counsel and Counsel for Blue Cross and Blue Shield Association; Health Care Service Corporation, an Illinois Mutual Legal Reserve Company, including its divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Mexico and Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Oklahoma; HCSC Insurance Services Company; Highmark, Inc., Highmark Blue Cross Blue Shield West Virginia; Highmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Delaware; California Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of California

R. David Kaufman
M. Patrick McDowell
BRUNINI GRANTHAM GROWER & HEWES PLLC
The Pinnacle Building, Suite 100
190 East Capitol Street
Jackson, MS 39201
601-948-3101
(fax) 601-960-6902
dkaufman@brunini.com
pmcdowell@brunini.com

Cheri D. Green
BLUE CROSS & BLUE SHIELD OF MISSISSIPPI
PO Box 1043
Jackson, MS 39215
601-932-3704
cdgreen@bcbsms.com

Counsel for Blue Cross Blue Shield of Mississippi, A Mutual Insurance Company

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Georgia, Inc.; Anthem Insurance Companies, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Indiana); Anthem Health Plans of Maine, Inc.; HMO Missouri, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Missouri); Anthem Health Plans of New Hampshire, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Hampshire); Anthem Health Plans of Virginia, Inc. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Virginia Inc.); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of North Carolina, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.; BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Carolina; Hawaii Medical Service Association (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii); Horizon Healthcare Services, Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); WellPoint, Inc.; Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode Island; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Vermont; Anthem Holdings Corp. (Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield); Anthem Blue Cross Life and Health Insurance Company; Anthem Health Plans of Kentucky, Inc.; Anthem Holdings Corp.; Anthem Life Insurance Company; RightChoice Managed Care, Inc.; Healthy Alliance Life Insurance Company; Anthem Blue Cross (Blue Cross of California, Blue Cross of California Partnership Plan, Inc., Blue Cross of Southern California, Blue Cross of Northern California); Rocky Mountain Hospital & Medical Service Inc. d/b/a Anthem Blue Cross Blue Shield of Colorado; Rocky Mountain Hospital & Medical Service Inc. d/b/a Anthem Blue Cross Blue Shield of Nevada; Empire BlueCross BlueShield (Empire HealthChoice Assurance, Inc.); Blue Cross Blue Shield of Wisconsin (Anthem Blue Cross Blue Shield of Wisconsin); Community Insurance Company as Anthem Blue Cross Blue Shield of Ohio; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (of Washington); Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon

Helen E. Witt, P.C.
Jeffrey J. Zeiger, P.C.
Erica B. Zolner
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
300 North LaSalle Street
Chicago, IL 60654
312-862-2000
(fax) 312-862-2200
helen.witt@kirkland.com
jeffrey.zeiger@kirkland.com
erica.zolner@kirkland.com

Counsel for Health Care Service Corporation, including its divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Oklahoma and Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas; Caring for Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.; Highmark Health Services, d/b/a Highmark Blue Cross Blue Shield and d/b/a Highmark Blue Shield; Highmark BCBS Inc. d/b/a Highmark Blue Cross Blue Shield Delaware; Highmark West Virginia Inc. d/b/a Highmark Blue Cross Blue Shield West Virginia; Counsel for California Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of California

David J. Zott, P.C.
Daniel E. Laytin, P.C.
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
300 North LaSalle
Chicago, IL 60654
Tel: (312) 862-2000
Fax: (312) 862-2200
david.zott@kirkland.com
daniel.laytin@kirkland.com
anne.salomon@kirkland.com

Counsel for Defendants Wellmark of South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota); Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Iowa)

Jonathan M. Redgrave
Redgrave, LLP
14555 Avion Parkway
Suite 275 F
Chantilly, VA 20151
703-592-1155
(fax) 612-332-8915
jredgrave@redgravellp.com

Additional Counsel for HCSC and Highmark Defendants

Evan R. Chesler
Christine A. Varney
Karin A. DeMasi
Margot A. Miller
CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP
Worldwide Plaza
825 Eighth Avenue
New York, NY 10019
Tel: (212) 474-1000
Fax: (212) 474-3700
echesler@cravath.com
cvarney@cravath.com
kdemasi@cravath.com
mamiller@cravath.com

Robert R. Riley, Jr.
RILEY & JACKSON, P.C.
3530 Independence Drive
Birmingham, AL 35209
Tel: (205) 879-5000
Fax: (205) 879-5901
rob@rileyjacksonlaw.com

John D. Briggs
Rachel J. Adcox
Kenina J. Lee
AXINN VELTROP & HARKRIDER LLP
950 F Street, NW, 7th Floor
Washington, DC 20004
202-912-4700
(fax) 202-912-4701
jbriggs@axinn@avhlaw.com
radcox@avhlaw.com
klee@avhlaw.com

Stephen A. Rowe
Aaron G. McLeod
ADAMS AND REESE LLP
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 3000
Birmingham, AL 35203
205-250-5000
(fax) 205-250-5034
steve.rowe@arlaw.com
aaron.mcleod@arlaw.com

Counsel for Independence Blue Cross

Counsel for Defendant BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this the 17th day of May, 2017, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF filing system, which will send a copy to all counsel of record.

/s/ Andrew P. Campbell

Andrew P. Campbell